

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:19-cv-03112-NRB**

American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals v.  
The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service et al  
Assigned to: Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 04/08/2019  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of  
Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**American Society for the Prevention of  
Cruelty to Animals**

represented by **Jennifer Helen Chin**  
Simpson Thacher & Bartlett LLP (NY)  
425 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10017  
(212) 455-2265  
Fax: (212) 455-2502  
Email: [jchin@stblaw.com](mailto:jchin@stblaw.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Bonnie Weiss McLeod**  
Cooley LLP (DC)  
1299 Pennsylvania Ave., Nw, Suite 700  
Washington, DC 20004  
(202) 842-7800  
Fax: (202) 842-7899  
Email: [bweissmcleod@cooley.com](mailto:bweissmcleod@cooley.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Erin Murray Estevez**  
Cooley LLP (DC)  
1299 Pennsylvania Ave., Nw, Suite 700  
Washington, DC 20004  
(202)-728-7065  
Fax: (202)-842-7899  
Email: [eestevez@cooley.com](mailto:eestevez@cooley.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Robert G. Hensley , Jr.**  
American Society For The Prevention of  
Cruelty To Animals NY  
(Aspca)  
520 Eighth Avenue  
New York, NY 10018  
(917)-716-5105  
Email: [robert.hensley@aspca.org](mailto:robert.hensley@aspca.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Tamara Yvette Feliciano**  
American Society For The Prevention of  
Cruelty To Animals NY  
(Aspca)  
520 Eighth Avenue  
New York, NY 10018  
646-832-8759  
Email: [tamara.feliciano@aspca.org](mailto:tamara.feliciano@aspca.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Kaitland Mccann Kennelly**  
Cooley LLP  
55 Hudson Yards

New York, NY 10001  
212-479-6643  
Email: [kkennelly@cooley.com](mailto:kkennelly@cooley.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

V.

**Defendant**

**The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service**

represented by **Natasha Waglow Teleanu**  
United States Attorney's Office, SDNY  
86 Chambers Street, 3rd fl.  
New York, NY 10007  
212-637-2528  
Fax: 212-637-2786  
Email: [natasha.teleanu@usdoj.gov](mailto:natasha.teleanu@usdoj.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Defendant**

**The United States Department of Agriculture**

represented by **Natasha Waglow Teleanu**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
04/08/2019	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service, The United States Department of Agriculture. (Filing Fee \$ 400.00, Receipt Number ANYSDC-16644863) Document filed by American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – Correspondence)(Kennelly, Kaitland) (Entered: 04/08/2019)
04/08/2019	<u>2</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Kennelly, Kaitland) (Entered: 04/08/2019)
04/08/2019	<u>3</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. (Kennelly, Kaitland) (Entered: 04/08/2019)
04/08/2019	<u>4</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to The United States Department of Agriculture, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. (Kennelly, Kaitland) (Entered: 04/08/2019)
04/08/2019	<u>5</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. No Corporate Parent. Document filed by American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals.(Kennelly, Kaitland) (Entered: 04/08/2019)
04/09/2019		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above–entitled action is assigned to Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District</a> . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php</a> . (pc) (Entered: 04/09/2019)
04/09/2019		Magistrate Judge Barbara C. Moses is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php</a> . (pc) (Entered: 04/09/2019)
04/09/2019		Case Designated ECF. (pc) (Entered: 04/09/2019)
04/09/2019	<u>6</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service. (pc) (Entered: 04/09/2019)

04/09/2019	<u>7</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to The United States Department of Agriculture. (pc) (Entered: 04/09/2019)
04/15/2019	<u>8</u>	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED (FOIA CASE). The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service served on 4/10/2019, answer due 5/10/2019. Service was accepted by United States Attorney's Office. Document filed by American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. (Kennelly, Kaitland) (Entered: 04/15/2019)
04/15/2019	<u>9</u>	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED (FOIA CASE). The United States Department of Agriculture served on 4/10/2019, answer due 5/10/2019. Service was accepted by United States Attorney's Office. Document filed by American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. (Kennelly, Kaitland) (Entered: 04/15/2019)
04/15/2019	<u>10</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE (FOIA CASE). Service was made by Certified Mail. Document filed by American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. (Kennelly, Kaitland) (Entered: 04/15/2019)
04/23/2019	<u>11</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Kaitland Mccann Kennelly on behalf of American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. (Kennelly, Kaitland) (Entered: 04/23/2019)
05/06/2019	<u>12</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jennifer Helen Chin on behalf of American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. (Chin, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/06/2019)
05/06/2019	<u>13</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Natasha Waglow Teleanu on behalf of The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service, The United States Department of Agriculture. (Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 05/06/2019)
05/07/2019	<u>14</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to respond to the complaint</i> addressed to Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald from Natasha W. Teleanu dated 5/7/2019. Document filed by The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service, The United States Department of Agriculture.(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 05/07/2019)
05/07/2019	<u>15</u>	MOTION for Erin M. Estevez to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-16835541. <b>Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.</b> Document filed by American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Declaration of Erin M. Estevez, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing – Virginia, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing – District of Columbia, # <u>4</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Estevez, Erin) (Entered: 05/07/2019)
05/07/2019	<u>16</u>	ORDER: granting <u>14</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. Application Granted. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 5/07/2019) (ama) (Entered: 05/07/2019)
05/07/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service answer due 5/24/2019; The United States Department of Agriculture answer due 5/24/2019. (ama) (Entered: 05/07/2019)
05/07/2019		<b>&gt;&gt;&gt;NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. <u>15</u> MOTION for Erin M. Estevez to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-16835541. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (ma)</b> (Entered: 05/07/2019)
05/08/2019	<u>17</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE: granting <u>15</u> Motion for Erin M. Estevez to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 5/08/2019) (ama) (Entered: 05/08/2019)
05/14/2019	<u>18</u>	MOTION for Bonnie Weiss McLeod to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-16878453. <b>Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.</b> Document filed by American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Declaration of Bonnie Weiss McLeod, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing – Virginia, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing – District of Columbia, # <u>4</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Weiss McLeod, Bonnie) (Entered: 05/14/2019)
05/14/2019		<b>&gt;&gt;&gt;NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. <u>18</u> MOTION for Bonnie Weiss McLeod to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-16878453. Motion and supporting papers to be</b>

		<b>reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (bcu)</b> (Entered: 05/14/2019)
05/14/2019	<u>19</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE: granting <u>18</u> Motion for Bonnie Weiss McLeod to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 5/14/2019) (ama) (Entered: 05/14/2019)
05/20/2019	<u>20</u>	LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Amended Complaint addressed to Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald from Erin M. Estevez dated May 20, 2019. Document filed by American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals.(Estevez, Erin) (Entered: 05/20/2019)
05/20/2019	<u>21</u>	ORDER granting <u>20</u> Letter Motion for Leave to File Document. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 5/20/2019) (ks) (Entered: 05/21/2019)
05/21/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service answer due 7/1/2019; The United States Department of Agriculture answer due 7/1/2019. Amended Pleadings due by 5/31/2019. (ks) (Entered: 05/21/2019)
05/31/2019	<u>22</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>1</u> Complaint, against The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service, The United States Department of Agriculture.Document filed by American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint,. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – ASPCA's correspondence with U.S. Attorney's office)(Estevez, Erin) (Entered: 05/31/2019)
06/14/2019	<u>23</u>	MOTION for Tamara Y. Feliciano to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-17087364. <b>Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.</b> Document filed by American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Declaration of Tamara Y. Feliciano, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing – Georgia, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Feliciano, Tamara) (Entered: 06/14/2019)
06/14/2019		<b>&gt;&gt;&gt;NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. <u>23</u> MOTION for Tamara Y. Feliciano to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-17087364. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (jc)</b> (Entered: 06/14/2019)
06/18/2019	<u>24</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE granting <u>23</u> Motion for Tamara Y. Feliciano to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 6/18/2019) (mro) (Entered: 06/19/2019)
07/01/2019	<u>25</u>	LETTER MOTION for Conference re: <u>22</u> Amended Complaint, <i>and anticipated partial motion to dismiss</i> addressed to Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald from Natasha W. Teleanu dated 7/1/2019. Document filed by The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service, The United States Department of Agriculture.(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 07/01/2019)
07/08/2019	<u>26</u>	LETTER RESPONSE in Opposition to Motion addressed to Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald from Erin Estevez dated July 8, 2019 re: <u>25</u> LETTER MOTION for Conference re: <u>22</u> Amended Complaint, <i>and anticipated partial motion to dismiss</i> addressed to Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald from Natasha W. Teleanu dated 7/1/2019. . Document filed by American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. (Estevez, Erin) (Entered: 07/08/2019)
07/18/2019	<u>27</u>	MOTION for Robert G. Hensley, Jr. to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-17269970. <b>Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.</b> Document filed by American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Declaration of Robert G. Henley, Jr., # <u>2</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing – North Carolina, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Hensley, Robert) (Entered: 07/18/2019)
07/18/2019		<b>&gt;&gt;&gt;NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. <u>27</u> MOTION for Robert G. Hensley, Jr. to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-17269970. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (bcu)</b> (Entered: 07/18/2019)

07/18/2019	<u>28</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE: granting <u>27</u> Motion for Robert G. Hensley, Jr. to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 7/18/2019) (ama) (Entered: 07/18/2019)
07/25/2019		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald: Telephone Conference held on 7/25/2019. (ade) (Entered: 07/31/2019)
08/12/2019	<u>29</u>	ANSWER to <u>22</u> Amended Complaint., Document filed by The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service, The United States Department of Agriculture.(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 08/12/2019)
09/05/2019	<u>30</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald from Natasha W. Teleanu dated 9/5/2019 re: Status Update. Document filed by The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service, The United States Department of Agriculture.(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 09/05/2019)
10/11/2019	<u>31</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald from Natasha W. Teleanu dated 10/11/2019 re: status update. Document filed by The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service, The United States Department of Agriculture.(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 10/11/2019)
10/15/2019	<u>32</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT: on re: <u>31</u> Letter filed by The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service, The United States Department of Agriculture. ENDORSEMENT: Application Granted. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 10/15/2019) (ama) (Entered: 10/15/2019)
10/25/2019	<u>33</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald from Natasha W. Teleanu dated 10/25/2019 re: status update and proposed briefing schedule. Document filed by The Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service, The United States Department of Agriculture.(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 10/25/2019)